15-462 Project 3: OpenGL Shader Programming

Release Date: Monday, February 14, 2011
Due Date: Monday, March 14, 2011, 23:59:59

Starter Code: http://www.cs.cmu.edu/afs/cs/academic/class/15462-s11/www/project/p3.tar.gz

Useful references:
OpenGL Reference Pages: http://www.opengl.org/sdk/docs/man/

1 Overview

In this lab you will learn about shader programming. The lab consists of rendering a scene, similar to previous labs, using OpenGL. However, in this lab you will render a new effect that requires shader programming. Specifically, you will render outlines of the objects in the scene, which is done using a multi-pass rendering method and shaders.

This lab requires a firm understanding of OpenGL textures and the OpenGL Shader Language (GLSL). The OpenGL Programming Guide and GLSL quick reference chart are both very useful tools. Additionally, the OpenGL Shading Language book or “Orange Book” may also be useful (although acquiring a copy is not necessary to complete this assignment). http://www.lighthouse3d.com/opengl/gls1/ also has a fairly comprehensive tutorial on shaders.

2 Description

This lab is about rendering outlines, similar to a cartoon drawing. You will take a standard rendering of a scene using Blinn-Phong shading and add black outlines around the geometry. Outlines are an example of non-photo-realistic rendering (NPR). They do not occur in real life, but have uses in graphics in visualizing things. They can be used to create a cartoony, hand-drawn effect, or increase clarity in a visualization by highlighting edges of objects. However, the standard fixed-functionality pipeline cannot support such rendering, so you will have to take advantage of the programmable hardware features of the GPU.
2.1 Global Rendering

If you remember, OpenGL’s rendering is object-based, meaning the rendering of a single pixel is independent of surrounding pixels. In fact, OpenGL throws away all intermediate data for each pixel immediately after rendering. Generating outlines, however, is an example of global rendering. You need information about more than one pixel to decide whether to place an outline at a given pixel.

So how can we accomplish this task with OpenGL? We will use multiple rendering passes to accomplish the goal. Only the final rendering pass will produce an output image. The earlier passes all store intermediate data needed for later passes. The output images of the earlier passes will be used in later passes as textures.

2.2 Shaders

The fixed-functionality only gives us a few pieces of output data by default, such as the depth buffer and color buffer. While we’ll need both of these, we need other intermediate information. Furthermore, fixed-functionality won’t let us use our intermediate information in the way we need.

So we will have to ditch fixed-functionality and program the GPU hardware with what are called shaders. Certain stages of the rendering pipeline aren’t actually fixed and can do much more general operations. Shaders are the programs that can be run on these stages.

There are 2 shaders you will use. The vertex shader runs once for each vertex, transforming the attribute data to compute, among other things, the transformed position of that vertex. The fragment shader runs once for each pixel of each primitive, computing the final color of the fragment. It is called a fragment rather than a pixel since a pixel can have multiple fragments, each from a different primitive, which can all impact the final pixel color. More details are in section 7.2.

2.3 Generating Outlines with Shaders

2.3.1 Edge Detection and Outlines

Creating a basic outline is a fairly straightforward process, involving simple edge detection. Outlines can be computed on any array of pixels, like an image. In our case, we’ll be computing outlines on a pixel buffer on the video card. But it works the same for any case.

Edge detection is an example of a convolution filter. We can think of a convolution filter as a function that operates like a sliding window over the pixels of an image. For each pixel, we compute its value as linear combination of the neighboring pixels.

In the case of edge detection, we could break this into two convolutions: one for horizontal edges and one for vertical edges. To compute the amount of edge at a given pixel, we take the difference of the neighboring pixels. For horizontal
edges, this is the difference between a pixel’s upper and lower neighbors. For vertical edges, we look at a pixel’s left and right neighbors. The magnitude of the edge will then be the sum of the magnitudes of the horizontal and vertical edge values. For example, suppose $I$ is our image, and $(j, k)$ is the index of the current pixel. Equation 1 would compute the magnitude of the edge at that pixel.

$$edge_{j,k} = |I_{j+1,k} - I_{j-1,k}| + |I_{j,k+1} - I_{j,k-1}|$$  \hspace{1cm} (1)

Note, however, that there are multiple algorithms for measuring the amount of edge, and you are not constrained to any one in particular.

To get an outline, we choose a cutoff value, and consider every pixel with an edge value beyond this cutoff to be part of the outline. We then modify those pixels in the original image to look like an outline. For example, make them all solid black.

Convolution filters are easily implemented in a fragment shader, since the shader runs once for each pixel. It can use textures to look at neighboring pixels and compute an edge value, and then modify the current pixel if necessary.

### 2.3.2 Creating the Outline of a Scene

The only remaining question is to decide which buffer on which to do edge detection. Doing it on the color buffer won’t give us quite the results we want, since we want to outline the actual objects, not different colors.

The depth buffer makes a good candidate, since the boundaries between object/background and object/object will have a big difference in the depth, and one object will only have smooth transitions in depth and thus get no outline.

But that’s not quite enough. You’d also want an outline, say, at the corner of a wall, but there is no difference in depth there. What is very different at those points are the surface normals. So we can compute the difference in angle between surface normals of each pixel to generate a second outline, and composite them together.

### 2.3.3 Implemented as a Shader

This leads to a multi-pass algorithm for generating outlines. You need to produce 3 different buffers: a color buffer of the actual rendering, the depth buffer, and a buffer containing the normals. This can be done in one or more rendering passes using the fixed-functionality and shaders.

Next you have to gather those buffers and store them as textures. There are many strategies for this; see section 7.5 for suggestions.

You then do a final rendering pass in which a shader uses all of these buffers to generate an outline and composite the final image. This gets rendered to the screen.
3 Submission Process and Handin Instructions

Failure to follow submission instructions will negatively impact your grade.

1. Your handin directory may be found at
   /afs/cs.cmu.edu/academic/class/15462-s11-users/andrewid/p3/. All your files should be placed here. Please make sure you have a directory and are able to write to it well before the deadline; we are not responsible if you wait until 10 minutes before the deadline and run into trouble. Also, remember that you must run aklog cs.cmu.edu every time you login in order to read from/write to your submission directory.

2. You should submit all files needed to build your project, as well as any textures, models, shaders, or screenshots that you used or created. Your deliverables include:
   - src/ folder with all .cpp and .hpp files.
   - Makefile and all *.mk files
   - writeup.txt
   - Any models/textures/shaders needed to run your code.

3. Please do not include:
   - The bin/ folder or any .o or .d files.
   - Executable files
   - Any other binary or intermediate files generated in the build process.

   Run make clean before submitting. If you were using Visual Studio, be sure to clean the solution before submitting.

4. Do not add levels of indirection when submitting. For example, your makefile should be at .../andrewid/p3/Makefile, not ...
   /andrewid/p3/myproj/Makefile or ...
   /andrewid/p3/p3.tar.gz. Please use the same arrangement as the handout.

5. We will enter your handin directory, and run make clean & make, and it should build correctly. The code must compile and run on the GHC cluster machines. Be sure to check to make sure you submit all files and that it builds correctly.

6. The submission folder will be locked at the deadline. There are separate folders for late handins, one for each day. For example, if using one late day, submit to ...
   /andrewid/p3-late1/. These will be locked in turn on each subsequent late day.
Figure 1: Example rendering with outlines. This is not a reference shot, just an example. Your renderings will differ.

4 Required Tasks

A very general overview of the implementation requirements is as follows. Refer to subsequent sections of the handout for more details.

Input: We provide you with a function to render a scene, and we provide an example shader which is not part of the scene rendering.

Output: You must use a shader to modify this rendering to have black outlines. There are no specific requirements on how exactly they look, other than they must be based on a combination of difference in depth and difference in surface normal. You are also free to choose how exactly edges are measured.

Requirements:

- Your program must work on all scenes we give you, in the scene/ folder.
- Generate an outline based on differences in fragment depth.
- Generate an outline based on differences in surface normal direction.
- Composite these outlines onto the original scene.
- Submit a few screen shots of your program’s renderings.
- Fill out writeup.txt with details on your implementation.
- Use good code style and document well. We will read your code.
At a minimum, you must modify project.cpp and project.hpp in the folder glsl/ and writeup.txt, though you may modify or add additional source files. writeup.txt should contain a description of your implementation, along with any information about your submission of which the graders should be aware. Provide details on which methods and algorithms you used for the various portions of the lab. Essentially, if you think the grader needs to know about it to understand your code, you should put it in this file. You should also note which source files you edited and any additional ones you have added.

Examples of things to put in writeup.txt:

- Mention parts of the requirements that you did not implement and why.
- Describe any complicated algorithms used or algorithms that are not described in the book/handout.
- Justify any major design decisions you made, such as why you chose a particular algorithm or method.
- List any extra work you did on top of basic requirements of which the grader should be aware.

There is also opportunity for up to 10% extra credit by implementing things above the minimum requirements. See section 8 for more details. Particularly impressive projects may be eligible to win a prize.

5 Starter Code

It is recommended that you begin by first reviewing the starter code as provided. Most of it is the same as the previous project. The README gives a breakdown of each source file. As before, you mainly need to care about glsl/project.hpp and glsl/project.cpp.

We’ve added a lot of new files this time. Most of these can be ignored. Almost all the new code involves the scene rendering we provide you. It will become more important in the raytracing lab, since it is the same scene format you must render with raytracing. For now, however, you don’t need to bother reading/editing any of it. Everything you need is declared in project.hpp and the math/ folder.

There is also an example shader enabled in the starter code by default. It is not part of the scene rendering, but merely there to provide example code for creating and using GLSL shaders.

5.1 Building and Running the Code

The code is designed to run and build on the SCS Linux machines and comes with a makefile. Consult the README for more detailed build and running instructions.

We have also provided a Visual Studio 2008 solution, though it will take a bit of effort to get working since the programs have required command-line arguments. More details are in the README. If you use Windows, your project
still must build and run on GHC Linux machines, so you will still have to test it on them before submitting. There are some differences in the compilers, so code that compiles and works with Visual Studio may not compile or run correctly with GCC. Make sure you test it well before the deadline. Be sure not to submit Windows binaries, either.

Note that since this project takes advantage of newer GPU technologies, not all computers will be able to run GLSL shaders or some of the other OpenGL technologies you may need. Any computer with a dedicated graphics card from the last 5 years should be fine. All of the Wean and GHC Linux machines are fine.

Note that subtle driver bugs and differences may cause your shader to not compile or behave differently on the school machines. Be sure to test on the school machines.

5.2 What You Need to Implement

project.cpp contains some empty shell functions for you to fill in. At a minimum, you should implement the initialize, destroy, and render functions. Documentation for each function is in the source file.

Feel free to modify any existing code or add new files, as long as you do not break the behavior of the program.

6 Grading: Visual Output and Code Style

Your project will be graded both on the visual output (both screenshots and running the program) and on the code itself. We will read the code.

In this assignment, part of your grade is on the quality of the visuals, in addition to correctness of the math. So make it look nice. Extra credit may be awarded for particularly good-looking projects. See section 8 for more extra credit opportunities.

Part of your grade is dependent on your code style, both how you structure your code and how readable it is. You should think carefully about how to implement the solution in a clean and complete manner. A correct, well-organized, and well-thought-out solution is better than a correct one which is not.

We will be looking for correct and clean usage of the C language, such as making sure memory is freed and many other common pitfalls. These can impact your grade. Additionally, we will comment on your C++-specific usage, though we will generally be more lenient with points. More general style and C-specific style (i.e., rules that apply in both C and C++) will, however, affect your grade.

Since we read the code, please remember that we must be able to understand what your code is doing. So you should write clearly and document well. If the grader cannot tell what you are doing, then it is difficult to provide feedback on your mistakes or assign partial credit. Good documentation is a requirement.
7 Implementation Details

7.1 Scene Format

Rather than making you render the scene, we simply provide you with a function that renders the scene for you. Your algorithm should work independently of what is drawn in the scene, so you should not need to know the details of the rendering function.

There is one exception: it necessary to know the near and far planes used when rendering to convert depth values correctly. Therefore, we provide access to the camera. However, you do not need to set the transformation matrices using the camera. This is done for you. You only use the camera to access values needed for your shaders.

Therefore, you won’t actually be sending any primitives to the GPU, as the starter code does that for you. You should set up your shader code and use the function we give you to render the scene, collecting the data you need to create outlines. You can even call it multiple times.

For convenience, all scenes will be approximately the same size and contain similarly-size objects, so you should not have to tweak the shaders to get decent results for different scenes. The function we give you will not modify the OpenGL state; that is, the OpenGL state will be the same after the call as before.

7.2 More on Shaders

Here’s a bit more detail on shader programming, though you should use other resources for a more comprehensive description. While programming, the quick-ref card is an invaluable resource. This is more just some random details that are important for this lab.

7.2.1 Debugging Shaders

Unfortunately, there are not many good, free solutions for debugging shaders, particularly on the school machines. You don’t even have print statements to help you. Therefore, it will take some patience and creativity to figure out what is wrong with your program. Instead of print statements, you may have to rely on a lot of test code to help pinpoint which lines of your shader are not working correctly.\footnote{One possible trick for fragment shaders is to output and intermediate variable as the final color, which will give you a visualization of that variable for each pixel. You’ll of course need to come up with some way of representing your variable as a color.}

7.2.2 Variable Modifiers

While local variables are pretty much the same as C, global variables in a shader have some modifiers that affect how they are used and created. You may recall that in fixed-functionality, there were two types of variables you can send to the
GPU, uniform and attribute. Both these kinds can be used in shaders, along with a few others:

**const** These are constants that must be set where declared and cannot be changed. They are identical in both the vertex and fragment shaders.

**uniform** These are set by the application and cannot be modified by the shaders. You declare them in the shader and set them in the C++ program using the `glUniform` family of functions. They must be the same for an entire primitive. Most of the OpenGL state with which you are familiar (e.g., the model-view matrix, material colors, light position) are actually built-in uniform variables which you do not need declare. The quick-ref card lists these. Uniforms can be read by both vertex and fragment shaders.

**attribute** These are per-vertex data. Like uniforms, the shader declares them and they are set by the application. Vertex, normal, and texture coordinate are examples of built-in attributes, which are listed on the reference card. Attributes can only be read by the vertex shader (since they are per-vertex data). You can also create custom attributes, though you shouldn’t need any for this lab.

**varying** These are used to pass intermediate data from the vertex shader to the fragment shader. They must be set by the vertex shader. The values are linearly interpolated for each fragment using each vertex in the primitive and then passed into the fragment shader, where they are read-only.

**Note:** Be very careful with varying variables. Since they are linearly interpolated, they are not suitable to pass certain data. For example, passing a transformation matrix will almost certainly not work, since the linear combination of transformation matrices won’t necessarily result in a transformation similar to the original ones.

### 7.3 OpenGL Extensions

Since newer OpenGL functions aren’t supported on all graphics cards, most systems don’t actually have header files with all the OpenGL functions in them. In fact, nearly every function added to OpenGL in the past 10 years in not available by default on most systems. OpenGL uses an extension mechanism to gain access to newer functions.

We take care of most of the process for you using an external library call GLEW. The only thing of which you need to be aware is that most functions in OpenGL are appended with letters indicating that they are an extension. For example, nearly all functions associated with shaders are appended with ARB, e.g., `glUniform1fARB` instead of `glUniform1f`. Also, not all graphics cards will support these features, so your machine may not have them available. The course staff highly suggests you make sure your video driver is up-to-date to
ensure that you have access to all OpenGL functions of which your card is capable.

7.4 Using Textures in Shaders

As always, consult the OpenGL documentation for more detailed information about this.

One of the easiest methods for doing an image-based computation with a shader (e.g. outlines) is using OpenGL textures. You put the image data into textures. Then, you render a single, screen-sized quad, setting the texture coordinates such that the texture coordinate at each pixel corresponds to the matching pixel of the texture. For example:

```
... // rendering passes that store data in textures
... // bind textures and set shader
... // set projection and modelview to identity

// this assumes you’re using GL_TEXTURE_RECTANGLE_ARB
glBegin( GL_QUADS );
glTexCoord2f( 0.0f, 0.0f );
glVertex3f( -1.0f, -1.0f, -1.0f );
glTexCoord2f( width, 0.0f );
glVertex3f( 1.0f, -1.0f, -1.0f );
glTexCoord2f( width, height );
glVertex3f( 1.0f, 1.0f, -1.0f );
glTexCoord2f( 0.0f, height );
glVertex3f( -1.0f, 1.0f, -1.0f );
glEnd();
```

You set the vertex shader to pass on the texture coordinate, which will be interpolated for the fragment shader. Then you can use the fragment shader to do per-pixel computation, looking at any neighboring pixels you wish.

7.4.1 Texture Rectangle

While using normal 2D textures is possible, there are limitations. For most GPUs, 2D texture dimensions must be a power of 2,\(^2\) which doesn’t exactly match the screen size. So OpenGL has a texture rectangle extension, which lets you create textures of any size, say \(w\) pixels in width and \(h\) pixels in height. The texture coordinates then run from \((0, 0)\) to \((w, h)\) rather than \((0, 0)\) to \((1, 1)\),

\(^2\)This isn’t really true on newer cards; only older cards require it. However, even on some new cards, non-power-of-two-sized textures are much slower, to the point of unusability. Best to play it safe.
which makes it more natural and precise to lookup exact pixels. We suggest you use GL_TEXTURE_RECTANGLE rather than GL_TEXTURE_2D.\(^3\)

### 7.4.2 Samplers and Active Texture

OpenGL actually allows several textures to be bound simultaneously. There is the idea of an “active texture,” which, like everything else, is part of the state. Active texture slots are enumerated from 0 up, usually to around 8.

`glBindTexture` binds to the current active texture slot. The active texture can be changed with `glActiveTexture`. This will come in handy when you need to pass multiple textures to your shader simultaneously.

Textures may only be passed to shaders in a very specific way. A 2d texture handle has type `sampler2D` (`sampler2DRect` for texture rectangle). A sampler must be a `uniform` variable, so it must be set by the application. In the shader, use the `texture*` family of functions to do texture lookups.

When setting the sampler using `glUniform`, you do not use the OpenGL texture handle received from `glGenTextures`. Instead, you use the value of the active texture to which the texture is bound. For example:

```c
... // some declarations and initialization
// set active texture to slot 0
glActiveTexture( GL_TEXTURE0 );
// bind to slot 0
glBindTexture( GL_TEXTURE_RECTANGLE_ARB, tex_handle_a );
// set active texture to slot 1
glActiveTexture( GL_TEXTURE1 );
// bind to slot 1
glBindTexture( GL_TEXTURE_RECTANGLE_ARB, tex_handle_b );
// set uniform to tex_handle_a
glUniform1iARB( texture_a_loc, 0 );
// set uniform to tex_handle_b
glUniform1iARB( texture_b_loc, 1 );
```

### 7.5 Rendering a Buffer to a Texture

In order to use the results of a previous rendering pass, you must create a texture whose data is the buffer of the first rendering pass. OpenGL provides several methods to do this of varying complexity and performance. Any should be suitable for this assignment as long as it can run in real time.\(^4\)

The simplest method is to use `glReadPixels` and similar functions to read the buffer directly into CPU memory. Then you can load this data into a texture the same way one would create a texture from image data, using `glTexImage2d`. This is both the easiest to get working and the most well-supported by GPUs.

---

\(^3\) Though most of the docs don’t mention this, you can use `glTexImage2d` for texture rectangles. Just pass `GL_TEXTURE_RECTANGLE` as the first argument, instead of `GL_TEXTURE_2D`.

\(^4\) “Real time” roughly means at least 15 FPS, when compiled with optimizations. Remember that you need to build with `make MODE=release` to build with optimizations.
A more efficient and newer method involves Framebuffer Objects. A Framebuffer Object (FBO) is essentially a handle to buffer on the GPU to which rendering occurs. OpenGL provides the function `glFramebufferTexture2D` to bind a texture to an FBO, and thus the results of the render pass go directly into texture memory. This method, while certainly much faster, is somewhat more complicated and not supported on older GPUs. Note that this is an extension, and most functions will be appended with `EXT`. Consult the Red Book and online resources for more information.

Other methods exist, but these are the 2 recommended ones. The first is by far the simplest, while second is much faster yet still relatively simple. But you may use others if you wish.

### 7.6 Storing Information in Buffers

Most of the buffers and textures in OpenGL clamp values to be floats in the range $[0, 1]$ by default. This is true of both the depth buffer and color buffers. So you have to be a bit creative about storing data in them.

#### 7.6.1 The Depth Buffer

The depth buffer will be filled automatically by the fixed-functionality rendering. So all you have to do is get the depth buffer into a texture and use it. The depth buffer has its own special format that differs from a typical color buffer. You will need to use the `GL_DEPTH_COMPONENT` format for the texture. For FBOs, the buffer attachment is `GL_DEPTH_ATTACHMENT`.

The depth buffer stores the $z$ value with which the pixel was rendered. OpenGL will take care of converting $z$ values into the depth buffer, but your shader will need to convert it back. This conversion depends on the near and far planes; the far plane maps to a depth value of 1.0, and the near plane maps to a value of 0.0. Equation 2 shows how to convert from the depth buffer value, $d$, to the original distance, $z$, where $n$ is the near plane distance and $f$ is the far plane distance.

$$z = \frac{nf}{f - d(f - n)} \quad (2)$$

#### 7.6.2 The Normal Buffer

Since the fixed-functionality discards the normals, you’ll have to write a shader to store the normals in the color buffer, which will then be used as a texture in the next rendering pass.

A normal is only 3 values, so we can fit it into a normal 4-byte color buffer, where each component gets one byte. For normals, each component is in the range $[-1, 1]$, so you’ll have to make a simple bijection to squeeze them into $[0, 1]$ on the first rendering pass and then extract the original normal on the second.

Note that not every pixel will have a normal (e.g. areas with background color). Since we give you the rendering function, you don’t get to pick the
background color, but that shouldn’t be a big issue, since all background pixels should map to the same normal, and background edges will be covered by the depth outlines anyway.

### 7.7 Suggested Sequence

We suggest you implement the assignment in the following order:

1. Have a look at the example shader we provide to see how they work. You can then just remove this shader, or modify it to become your own shader.
2. Remove the shader and render the scene using fixed-functionality (we give you this).
3. Render the color buffer and its depth buffer to textures.
4. Write a shader to render the color buffer texture in a second pass without modifying it. So you’ll get the same output as if rendered without any shaders.
5. Modify the shader to add outlines based on the depth buffer texture.
6. Write another shader to copy the normals into a third buffer. This may require rendering the scene using fixed-functionality twice.
7. Modify the original shader to compute outlines based on normals as well.

### 8 Extra Credit

Any improvements, optimizations, or extra features for the project above the minimum requirements can be cause for extra credit, up to 10%. Particularly impressive projects may be eligible to win a prize. Extra credit is generally awarded for impressive achievements beyond the project requirements, at the discretion of the graders.

Ideas may include but are not limited to:

- Have outlines change thickness depending on distance from the camera.
- Make a smooth transition from line to no-line instead of a sharp cutoff.
- Make the outlines smooth by implementing some kind of anti-aliasing.
- Write additional shaders to do interesting effects to the scene.
  
  **Warning:** This does not mean copying some shader you find online and fiddling with it a little. We will only accept original, interesting shaders. So no basic stuff like toon shading; it has to be pretty impressive.

- Create additional, interesting scenes (even adding new kinds of geometry).
- Add animation and create an animated scene.
9 Words of Advice

9.1 General Advice

- As always, start early. This lab takes more time than previous ones.
- Make sure you have a firm understanding of textures before starting work.
- Familiarize yourself with the rendering pipeline and where vertex and fragment shaders fit in.
- Have a look at some example shaders to see how they operate.
- Particularly since you don’t have a good debugger, start with very simple shaders. Add new features iteratively, testing at each step. This will help you find shader bugs more quickly and painlessly.
- Be careful with memory allocation, as too many or too frequent heap allocations will severely degrade performance.
- Make sure you have a submission directory that you can write to as soon as possible. Notify course staff if this is not the case.
- While C has many pitfalls, C++ introduces even more wonderful ways to shoot yourself in the foot. It is generally wise to stay away from as many features as possible, and make sure you fully understand the features you do use.